THE IMPACT OF BLENDED LEARNING ON TEACHING L2 ACADEMIC WRITING SKILLS AT UNDERGRADUATE LEVEL IN PAKISTAN

Zaha Zaib   **M.phil, Department of Applied Linguistics, Government College University, Faisalabad.**

Dr. Shahida Naz   **Assistant Professor, Department of Applied Linguistics, Government College University Faisalabad.**

ABSTRACT

This research investigates the impact of face-to-face and blended instructions on the English writing proficiency of the undergraduate students of Government Post-Graduate College Faisalabad. Sixty students were divided into two groups as convenience sampling: The experimental group was made up of thirty students while the control group comprised a similar number. The students in the control group were taught using traditional methods of teaching the students in the experimental group used online classes and technology integrated classrooms. The pre- and post- tests for both groups involved sample IELTS writing tests in order to determine the improvement of students' writing skills. Furthermore, using a feedback form, basic qualitative information concerning the student experience and point of view was gathered. Data analysis was performed using the SPSS software version 2021 and independent sample t-test for the comparison of the groups. The study results revealed a positive effect of using online classes, face-to-face classes and enhanced techniques in teaching writing in the experimental group than in the control group as a result of the obtained p-value. Looking at the feedback questionnaire it was found that majority of the students appreciated when online resources were used to help them with their grammar and writing style. From the analysis of the results, the study concludes that instruction in blended learning is better than face-to-face instructions in teaching English writing skills to undergraduate students.

*Keywords***:** Blended learning, Writing skills, Feedback questionnaire

Introduction

The inculcation of new technologies in education and the changes in the approaches that are used in imparting knowledge have in recent years created a dramatic revolution in education. The expectations of a digital society assign educational institutions a new task, to offer more flexibility and individualization. This means it will enable students to receive a package that will suit their needs and the period they are in hence meeting their needs (Barnett, 2014). This is the case for the often use word 'flexible learning' that is broad and has several meanings (Hrastinski, 2019). In a more general sense, flexible learning environments should meet these different needs and wants of the students, and afford the students a larger degree of control over what is learned than does more traditional instruction (Wade, 1994).

As such strategy, blended learning has attracted a lot of focus. Blended learning is a form of education which integrates the elements of face-to-face training as well as the elements of information and communication technologies. Face to face and distance learning also falls under the various modes of learning that is instructed in the work, as do asynchronous and synchronous learning as well as in-person and virtual classes (Chaeruman, Wibawa, & Syahrial, 2018). In the current society, dispensation of learning through virtual and asynchronous mode is the primary use of (online) technology; learning in combination with face-to-face education is called blended learning. Traditionally for months, years and even generations, formal learning or more commonly

known as conventional learning has been the basis of education. This is a kind of learning where by the pupils are taken to real classrooms or any facility for instance school in order that the instructors be able to teach through communication, lessons, and other full body learning experiences. Undoubtedly, traditional learning is also employed in numerous educational facilities of various parts of the world and has influenced educational processes to a large extent. In this introduction, the focus is placed on the presuppositions, characteristics, advantages and disadvantages of traditional practices as the teaching methods.

Hrastinski (2019) notes that the most frequently cited definitions of blended learning that are available in scientific journal and peer-reviewed articles have been defined by Garrison and Kanuka (2004), according to whom 'blended learning' means the meaningful combination of 'classroom face-to-face learning' and 'online learning' (p. 4); and Graham (2006) who defined 'blended learning' as the systems that incorporate According to Smith and Hill, the problem with definitions of blended learning is that they are nebulous, include numerous approaches to teaching, and have failed for the most part to identify boundaries between what they incorporate. Allen et al. (2007) employed the online proportion of a learning environment as a differentiation criterion for the four modalities: desktop, web enhanced, blended/hybrid and totally online as shown in figure 1.

Figure 1

Classification of Courses According to the Proportion of Content Delivery Online

Type of Course	Proportion of Online Delivery Content	Description
Traditional	0%	A course with no online technology used – content is delivered in writing or orally.
Web-facilitated	1–29%	A course that uses web-based technology to facilitate what is essentially a face-to-face course. For example, it uses a course management system (CMS) or web pages to post the syllabus and assignments.
Blended/Hybrid	30–79%	A course that blends online and face-to-face delivery. A substantial proportion of the content is delivered online, typically features online discussions, and usually has some face-to-face meetings.
Online	>80%	A course where most or all the content is delivered online. It typically has no face-to-face meetings.

Note. Allen et al, 2007

This introduction explores blended learning, its comparison with other learning models/methods as well as its principles, advantages, and the effects on education. Literature about blended learning in the teaching of English is gradually growing more exciting as both the teachers and the students seize the opportunities that come with ICT. As it has been shown in numerous quantitative research endeavors of the prior decades, a combination of traditional face-to-face and online instruction, also referred to as blended learning results in more flexible and engaging educational experience However, there is evident absence of information on how such skills are developed in the long term in such studies. Nonetheless, blended learning is often praised for the ability to include the effectiveness of face-to-face instruction with the convenience of online materials, the majority of studies focus on the immediate outcomes such as students' satisfaction, course completion, and performance in the short term. Therefore, the aim of this study project is to analyze and assess blended learning's effects and outcomes in the teaching of English. The research objectives of this study are to analyze the effects of the blended learning strategy on the teaching of Academic Writing Skills in English Language at Undergraduate level in the context of Pakistan.

Literature Review

In a blended learning framework, Zahro (2023) has conducted an action research study in a classroom context within a blended learning environment to examine the efficacy of screencast feedback as an alternative mode of digital feedback in the context of academic writing classes. The study included three cycles with three distinct feedback styles: there are screencast feedback when the teacher appears, screencast feedback without the teacher's appearance, and text comments. There were phases for planning, implementing, observing, and reflecting in each cycle. Participant observation, documentation, and surveys were the methods used to gather the data. Descriptive qualitative approaches were used to analyse the data from the observations and documentation, and a percentage formula was used to analyse the survey responses. Each and every analytical result was triangulated. Based on the results, it was clear that screencast feedback improved students' writing abilities since more students passed the writing competency exam. Students described the screencast feedback was easy to comprehend, straightforward, and useful. They also mentioned better interpersonal relationships between teachers and students, more instructor appreciation, and a conversational environment during screencast feedback—especially when the teacher was physically present. The efficacy of screencast feedback in academic writing courses was further reinforced by the teachers' responses from each cycle. In summary, screencast feedback has been shown to be an effective strategy for improving students' writing of scientific articles in blended learning courses.

Guo (2023) investigated a study to look at the effects of scaffolding strategies on the self-efficacy and willingness to communicate (WTC) English as Foreign Language (EFL) students in blended learning (BL) environments. In order for language learning to be successful, it is imperative that teachers inspired their students to speak effectively. Additionally, fostering an environment in which students show a willingness to communicate is critical. Using a quasi-experimental approach, the study included 232 participants, including intermediate and advanced learners, in control and experimental groups. Pretest WTC and self-efficacy questionnaires were given to each group. Language competency and treatment type significantly moderated the impacts of self-efficacy ratings, according to statistical analysis, including two-way ANCOVA tests. Both the advanced learners and the experimental group did better than the intermediate learners and the control group, respectively. Moreover, the kind of therapy had a substantial impact on WTC scores, although language proficiency did not moderate WTC scores. These results implied that scaffolding strategies, especially for advanced learners, might enhance EFL students' self-efficacy and WTC in BL environments. The study emphasised how crucial it is to offer helpful assistance, such scaffolding, in order to inspire students and improve their BL learning experiences.

Anthony jnr. (2022) did a study on blended learning on the perception of the academic staff on higher level. It is an exploratory study only; this is to mean that the findings of this research will only be of exploratory nature. In the past decades, there has arisen a concept known as blended learning or by its full name blended learning and this has been embraced by universities across the globe as a technique of teaching and learning. Thus, one needs to consider the factors that might influence the attitudes of the instructors towards BL techniques. Consequently, the research papers that focused on BL from the perspective of lecturers were also less popular. For the purpose of improving teaching practice in higher learning institutions, this study proposed a framework grounded on the Model of Personal Computer Utilisation (MPCU) theory with the view of diagnosing the factors that affect lecturers' views about BL. E-mail questionnaires

were self-administered to a convenient sample of 413 academics derived from universities, colleges and polytechnics. Partial least square structural equation modelling and statistical package for social science was used in data analysis. The study results revealed that social factors such as use, complexity, job fit, future impact, supportive context, and IT knowledge impacted the acceptance of BL in higher education by influencing the lecturers' perception.

Alsowat (2022) examined Saudi secondary students' writing and digital literacy results under the virtual learning and the hybrid model. The study involved fifty-six Saudi secondary school students, and employed a quantitative quasi-experimental research design. The students were split into two experimental groups: Two groups were formed; a virtual learning group consisting of twenty-seven participants and the hybrid learning group with twenty-nine participants. To achieve the objective of the study, there were established the hybrid learning models as well as virtual learning models. In terms of data collection, the pre- and post-essay writing assessment and a four-questions mini-survey aimed at determining the students' pre- and post-digital literacy skills were completed. The research results indicated that there were huge measures of the impact and significant differences between the two groups of students; the students under the hybrid learning model outperformed their counterparts in all the aspects of essay writing. Moreover, the impact of each learning model on the student's digital literacy skills, it was revealed that the effective of the hybrid model learning on the students was beneficial compared to that of the virtual learning model. The study's conclusions were fully addressed, and recommendations for future research and practice were made in light of the findings. Overall, the study indicates that, when compared to virtual learning models, hybrid learning techniques may be more successful in helping Saudi secondary school students improve their essay writing and digital literacy abilities.

The study by El-Maghraby (2021) was intended to find out whether blended learning with Moodle could enhance the writing skills of Misr University for Science and Technology (MUST) first-year students as envisaged by the proposal. The sample was comprised of sixty learners coming from the Faculty of Foreign Languages and Translation. The experimental group was trained through conventional face-to-face methods while the control group was trained through instructions anchored on Moodle blended learning. In both the control and experimental groups, students' writing achievement was assessed through and quantitative data collection instruments at the onset and at the end of the study. To perform statistical analysis of the data that were obtained from the quantitative research methods, use of Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS)version 2021 was done. To compare the data, the method used was independent paired sample t-tests. As the conclusions of the study indicated, students' perception and response towards the application of blended learning exercises in a writing course was positive. Also, the Moodle-based BL learning approach improved students' overall writing skills as a result of the implementation of the proposed strategy. After considering all factors, it can be concluded that El-Maghraby's study provides evidence for the effectiveness of blended learning specifically Moodle in enhancing college students' writing skills. The positive sentiments of the students and the upgrades in the calibre of their scripts show a possibility that blended learning may enhance learning in writing classes.

Linguistics and communicative ability despite having been established as essential for students' writing skills must be fostered as part of writing instruction and learning, according to Rahman (2020). Its definition according to him hinges on the fact that it is methodical and planned approach that seeks to harness the power of face-to-face communication and virtual communications by using the right communication tools. In

this setting, both written and oral communication was adopted and this made the pupils to be engaged in a truly amazing learning process. Consequently, it is against this background that the following research objectives were formulated in order to achieve the above aim of the study: The aim of this study was to find out, through focus group interviews, the benefits of blended learning towards writing instruction for university students. The respondents consist of six second-year students from Universiti Sultan ZainalAbidin (UniSZA), Malaysia Sampling procedure was purposive. A qualitative analysis is conducted on the interview data through Identification of inductive themes. These outcomes confirmed that the strategy promotes students' interest in the subject, perceived competence, and written expression skills. According to the students, this method has provided the opportunity for studying with the friendly and flexible environment that enhanced their writing. Hence, in sharing the information that can be useful in the process of constructing curricula, primarily for higher learning institutions, it is expected that it will be useful to the language teachers as well as the educational policymakers.

In the current systematic review of the literature, Akhtar (2019) narrowed down his findings by only targeting academic writing research that addresses the challenges and strategies that learners encounter in the context of ESL. This screening yielded 27 research articles from the international refereed journals that were published between 2010 and the time the search was conducted. The evaluation divided issues into two primary categories: There are the Malaysian ESL students and then there are students from other countries and the findings here pertain to the Malaysian ESL students. The rationale for classifying the studies in this manner is evident in the Malaysian research context. The review helped in expanding the scope of the challenges faced by ESL students while writing academically and the factors that influence their writing skills. While earlier research has mostly concentrated on techniques to enhance students' writing abilities, the study highlighted three main obstacles that ESL students must overcome: instructional tender strategies, students' attitude towards English, and language proficiency. Some of the recommended strategies involved the application of active learning that includes Task-Based Learning (TBL), Blended Learning, Collaborative Learning, and Cognitive approaches on writing instructions in the teaching of English. The review ended on the note calling for recognition of the challenges that the ESL students face when writing for academic purposes, and to the suggestion that; the enhanced understanding of the writing skills of students could be effective achieved by practicing creative ELT strategies.

Research Questions

The study focuses on the following research questions towards shedding light on how different aspects of writing skills are affected by blended learning. The research questions are as following:

1. What is the Impact of Blended Learning on Teaching English Language Academic writingskills at Undergraduate Level in Pakistan?
2. How does the traditional teaching method and blended learning method cause variations inlearning of students at undergraduate level in Pakistan?
3. What is students' perspective regarding learning English through blended learning approach?

Methodology

This study has employed an experimental research method in an attempt to assess the effectiveness of blended learning in enhancing students' English general writing and grammatical skills among students of Government Post-Graduate College Faisalabad.

These include research design, procedure, method of data collection, and method of data analysis.

Design

As the research has employed an experimental research approach, it is necessary to compare the results given by the control group and the experimental group. While the members of the experimental group got instruction through a kind of parallel to the blended learning where the internet resources are incorporated in to the curriculum, the members of the control group were given traditional face-to-face instructions using paper-based materials.

Procedure

Selection of Participants

The participants of this study were selected from a government postgraduate college. Sixty students were included in the study and of these were split into thirty in the experimental group and thirty in the control group. One hundred students, sample is taken out from Government College Faisalabad for the purpose of convenience and is divided into two equal groups of thirty each as sample was reduced.

Administration of Pre- and Post-Tests

The control and experimental groups' English language proficiency was ascertained via the pre- and post-tests. All three tasks of the examination were designed based on the IELTS sample tests. For the task 1, the sections which were completed were multiple choice questions (MCQs); while for the other tasks 2 and 3, writing on pro-specified topics was required. Previous year students' responses on Task 1 were marked based on the key provided; Tasks 2 and 3 each were worth 5 marks and were granted on the standard set based on vocabulary, grammar, spelling, and writing element arrangement.

Treatment for Blended Learning

The experimental group, on the other hand, was exposed to a blended learning programmer for a span of two months. The approaches that were employed in this method of teaching include; both online instruction and access to other sources of learning information and mostly in class activities such as multimedia others and theatres. In this regard, while the experimental group was taught using the innovative method, the control group was taught in a normal way.

Data Collection

At the beginning and end of the treatment phase, data was collected using tests from the experimental group and the control group. Such findings were observed and subjected to a process of evaluation as well.

There are two primary techniques used to acquire data:

Pre-Test and Post-Test

. The post-test and the pre-test are similar regarding their structure and what they contain. This pre-test is formulated from a written English proficiency IELTS practice test and constitutes a combination of two sample tests. Since blended learning intervention is expected to improve writing skills of the students, the experimental group and control group have sat for post-test when the lesson is over

Feedback Questionnaire

A feedback form is developed by the researcher to gather further information regarding the participants' experience with the educational intervention. This was the fifteen closed-ended questions that formed the questionnaire; the questions allowed respondents to give detailed information on how incorporated into their learning they feel blended learning is.

Data Analysis

In the analysis of data, the Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS) version 2021 programmer is used. The following steps are included in the analysis:
The following steps are included in the analysis:

Independent sample t-test

This test is applicable for comparing the mean scores of the experimental group and the control group on both pre and post-test.

Mean Score Calculation: This makes it possible to have a quantitative comparison of the levels of writing proficiency that is; before and after implementation of blended learning.

Feedback Questionnaires Analysis

The data collected form the feedback questionnaires is semi structured and therefore undergo thematic analysis so as to arrive at the themes that characterize the students' answers. Thus, this qualitative research provides useful knowledge regarding students' perceptions on blended learning and its impact on writing skills.

Analysis

The pre-tests of both experimental and control groups are compared through SPSS (version 2021) independent sample t-test to check the level of both groups as:

The experiment group (EXP)'s average pre-test score is about 14. 97 while the CON group mean pre-test score is approximately 14. 1. For the categories of the experimental group and control group, the pre-test score variability stands at 51. 48 and 56. 02, respectively. Both of the above groups have thirty observations; however, they are divided between the two. The t-test characteristic contains the degrees of freedom equal to 58 and the anticipated mean difference is equal to zero based on the two groups. Looking at the above analysis, the t-statistic that was computed is approximately equal to 0. 458.

The approximate p- values for the one-tailed and two-tailed tests in turn are 0. 324 and 0. 649. For the given research, critical t-value is approximately equal to 2. 002 for the two-tailed test while for the one-tailed test it was 0. 672 for the one tailed test at alpha level 0. 05 and 58 degrees of freedom respectively. This analysis proves that the capability of both groups is similar in relation to taking pre-test by both groups.

The post-tests of both experimental and control groups are compared through SPSS (version 2021) independent sample t-test to check the level of both groups as:

The post-test means can be estimated at 20.73 for the experimental group (EXP) as compared to the control group (CON) that had almost a mean score of 16. 85 in the post-test. For the experimental and control groups, the post test score variance is almost 24. 55 and 37. 40, respectively. In each group we have a total of thirty observations and it is presumed that there is no mean difference between the two groups. The t-test therefore has fifty-six degrees of freedom and the estimated t-statistic here is slightly below 2.702.
The estimated p-values for the one-tailed as well as for the two-tailed test are, correspondingly, 0. 0045 and 0. 0091. At alpha level 0. This means that the t-value for the one tailed test situated at 05 and 56 degrees of freedom is around 1. 673, whereas in the case of two tailed test it is approximately 2.003. By our analysis of the data, we are able to conclude that our null hypothesis is rejected since 'p' has a value of 0. 0045 < than 0. 05. Therefore, it is possible to state that, based on the data obtained, the mean post-test scores of the experimental and control groups will differ significantly.

The pre and post-test of experimental group is analysed through SPSS (version 2021) independent sample t-test:

Mean pre-test scores of the experimental group are 14.97 while mean post-test is 20.93 with relative variances of 51.48 and 24.55. The number of observations in two groups is thirty and the true difference of means is hypothesized to be zero. The degrees of freedom for the t-test will be 52 degrees of freedom and the t-statistic determined above was -3.62. The one tailed p-value is 0. 00033 and the two-tailed p-value is 0.00066 which indicates a very strong positive relationship when making interpretations on the data attained. Since both are less than the significance level of 0, we reject the null hypothesis necessary in the comparison. Thus, it was proven that there is statistically significant difference in the obtained scores of the experimental group at pre-test and post-test. As observed in the study, the above-mentioned post-results of experimental group are more improved.

The pre and post-test of control group is analysed through SPSS version 2021 independent sample t-test as:

The control group has the pre-test mean of the score is 14.1 and the post-test mean score is 16. 85. Variance of pre-test and post-test, when the number of observations in each group are 30 and the estimated mean difference is 0, is 56. 02 and 37. 40, respectively. This will give a t-test of 56 degrees of freedom; and the t-statistic computed is -1.56

Hence, the test-statistic is more extreme then the null-hypothesis is rejected and the t-test statistic is computed and the two tailed p-value is 0.125 and one tailed p value 0.062 depending on the considerations of buyers as given by the interpretation. Because both are greater than the significance level of 0, the result indicates that due to the fact that the calculated chi square of 0.05, it is impossible to reject the null hypothesis. Then, in the control group there are no gains that can be seen when comparing the pre and post test scores.

As a result, the scores of the experimental group significantly differ from pre- and post-test indicators, while the indicators of the control group have no significant differences.

Feedback Questionnaire

A total of thirty-three participants completed the feedback survey providing detailed answers to the effect of the methodology of blended learning on their learning experience. The answers, further, cleared up several things about the effectiveness of the learning process.

Question 1: Improvement in Writing Skills

It is noticeable that 48.5% in the first item on the questionnaire of students reported a great improvement and relative to the second item of the questionnaire which asked students to rate the level of improvement of their learning outcomes after having included number problems in their teachings there was an overall improvement.

The aspects of blended learning have contributed to writing skills development which is shown as:

Question 2: Aspects of Blended Learning

In regarding to the second question of the questionnaires, the respondents' answers showed that 42.4% of the students agreed with the statement that claimed the greatest helpfulness of online writing lessons and tools could be reached by means of BL. This research proves that internet resources should be used in teaching and learning processes since students consider them useful in enhancing on their writing. The importance given to the notions underlying the value of online materials and tutorials

intensifies the significance of applying technology in regard to conventional approaches to teaching.

The frequent engagement of online materials in writing materials outside of class hours as:

Question 3: Engagement of Online Writing Materials

With regards to the third question, the results stand at 36. 4% among the students, stated that they engaged in the use of the internet resources in lessons once in a while and not on daily basis. The response provided by a student further indicates the frequency in which students used the internet resources for writing exercises and support. Still, based on the results The investigation showed that even with the internet presence being significant a great number of students utilized an internet background in what might be characterized as an irregular manner rather than constant.

The navigation of online writing material in blended learning has shown accessibility as:

Question 4: Online Writing Material accessibility in Blended Learning

The purpose of formulating Question 4 was to get more insights from the students about their perception of how helpful and convenient the online writing resources provided through the use of blended learning resources were. Thus, based on the results of the study, 60.4% can be said to have been reached with regard to the research questions. Another of the respondents were of the view that the items that were contained in the bios were very easy to locate as well as use. This large proportion assume that most students had easy access to these online materials and found them easy to use. Such encouraging comments suggest that the layout and style of the discussed online resources facilitated interaction with the information by students. How easy the tools had been to locate could have probably asserted the students' intention to use the tools for their writing practice and skill. Based on this research, it becomes imperative to provide students with nicely categorized and well anteriorized online resources for learning when learning takes place in blended teaching environments.

The effectiveness of online writing exercises and quizzes in helping the comprehension of grammar rules and writing techniques as shown as:

Question 5: Effectiveness of Online Writing Exercises and Quizzes

To assess students' understandings over how much the online writing activities and quizzes were helping them in terms of grasping grammatical rules and different approaches to writing, Question 5 was designed. Regarding the gathered answer statistics, 69.7% of the participants found these tests and activities extremely useful. This massive consensus shows that the students benefited a lot from the online exercises and it reinforced their writings and grammatical fundamentals. Perhaps the activities were successful because of their interaction-based structure; thus, students received 'training' in the use of grammatical rules in an entertaining manner.

The improvement in grammar skills implementation through blended learning is shown as:

Question 6: Improvement in Grammar Skills

The intention of Question 6 was to identify the sentiments of the students regarding the change in their grammar through the implementation of blended learning. Summing up, it can be suggested that 57.6% of participants admitted the considerable improvement of the grammatical proficiency. This consequence means that the learning theory of grammatical ability has been enhanced among the students through the use of blended learning strategy that utilizes online material and interactivity exercises.

The feedback mode for writing assignments is shown as:

Question 7: Feedback Mode for Writing Assignments

The purpose of Question 7 was to determine the students' opinion on what they would like to be done in order to receive feedback with regard to the written assignments. As per the outcomes of the current study, 36.4%. The teacher's response of participants would prefer this style of formative assessment in that they would like to receive written feedback from the teacher. This choice suggests that students value written feedback to be substantive, highly specific, and informative with suggestions for improvement. The provision of written comments also makes it possible for teachers to discuss individually to the learners giving them feedback based on their individual needs. As a result, it will be pertinent to consider the possibilities of written feedback as a pedagogical approach in writing classes and as a part of blended learning environments, by following student interests to enhance students' writing potentials.

The virtual writing workshops and discussions criteria are shown as:

Question 8: Virtual Writing Workshops and Discussions

The purpose of the question eight was to know students' perception of the extent to which the online writing workshops and conversations enhanced or developed their writing skills. Thus, main conclusions derived from the results are as follows: total number of respondents is 57. 6 percent. As for the participants' attitudes, believed that these online meetings were really helpful. This means that from the students' perspective, online seminars or debates with an element of cooperation and interaction are useful tools to develop writing skills and can include any materials that have been shared during the process. These forums enable the students to write to each other, receive feedbacks, and try out different approaches in writing in a risk-free environment.

The perception of integration of technology in learning English writing skills is as:

Question 9: Perception of Integration of Technology in Learning English Writing Skills

As dictated by the question asked in Question 9, the objective of the question was to ascertain the feelings of the students concerning the use of technology in teaching them how to write English. Subsequently, the studies yielded the following outcomes: 75. 8% of participants had good opinion and mentioned that using technology has positively affected their learning experience. Looking at the responses of the students on the usefulness of the technology as they try to improve on their writing skills in English, it is clear that majority of them hold the same view. Thus, as the technology advances even further, teachers will be able to effectively use modern resources and platforms which would create engaging and highly effective learning environments which will help students to improve their writing skills.

The active participation in collaborative writing tasks or groups facilitation through blended learning is considered which is shown as:

Question 10: Active Participation

Question 10 addressed whether the students participated in group projects or cooperative writing assignments that incorporated blended learning. From the results, 39.4% percent of the respondents were of the view that they received adequate training for the job that they were assigned to do. This suggests to mean that a good number of the students engage in group tasks or project work or cooperative writing tasks in a blend learning environment. Assignments such as group projects and projects involving writing different part give students a great opportunity to work in teams, discuss the concepts or material, and create contents as teams, which develops the notion of collective responsibility.

The perception of confidence in writing abilities before and after the blended learning is shown in figure 12 as:

Question 11: Perception of Confidence in Writing Abilities Before and After the Blended Learning

Students were asked in Question 11 to indicate their perceived level of their writing skill in comparison with before the preparation for the blended learning. Based on the findings from the research questionnaire, 60.6% percent of the employees. Specifically, students said that they feel more confident as a writer. The aforementioned discovery suggests that the combination of the traditional and the MMOR have a positive impact on the students' perceived writing abilities. Such an improvement in confidence could have been as a result of the blending practices where online tools, virtual meetings, online writing assignments, and similar components provided a safe practice environment for the students.

The utilization of additional resources used by participants as an outside tool to improve writing skill is shown as:

Figure 12: Utilization of Additional Resources

In an attempt to improve their writing skills, which is course requirement, students in Question 12 were asked if they use any other source or material not taught in the course. Pertaining to the replies received, 54.4% percent. Two percent of students reported that they have used extra resources rarely. This result means that while some of the students seek for extra information; in order to complement their learning, such behavior is not in all participants. Sometimes students may need to use other resources only because they do not have enough time or they studied in a different way or do not know what is available for them. Teachers may use this knowledge to encourage pupils to search for other sources and instruments that would prove to be helpful in writing. Informing the students on where they can find reliable information, recommending useful writing tools, or maybe including some optional extracurricular activities that would help in writing might all help students build the required skills better. Additionally, motivating students to be more independent also gives them the chance to become more proactive learners and seek for ways on how to improve more on their own.

The overall effectiveness rate of blended learning in improving English writing skills is shown as:

Question 13: Overall Effectiveness Rate of Blended Learning

In the light of the aim of Question 13, it was used in a bid to assess the level of satisfaction of the extent to which students regarded blended learning as having enhanced their skill in writing English. Consequently, the study reveals that 42 4% of the respondents opined that this response seems to suggest that although many students may be aware of the benefits of the hybrid approach to learning, they may not be fully sold on how it would impact there over all skills; especially in writing. From feedback, the state of students' learning and constant modifications made on the blended learning strategy, teaching and learning efficiency might be enhanced. Such feedback underlines the fact that it's important to constantly evaluate and enhance instructional strategies so as to guarantee that they fit the needs of learners and objectives of learning as well.

The perception of blended learning adequateness is shown as:

Question 14: Adequateness Rate of Blended Learning

The aim of Question 14 was to elicit the students' perception concerning the effectiveness of the blended learning in preparing them for college academic writing tasks. 42.4 % respondents rated themselves as to how prepared they felt for the test and of these individuals said that they felt extremely prepared based on the poll results. This indicates that a large percentage of the students believe that because of the blended learning they have received the information and

competency needed to write Undergraduate Academic writing tasks. Such enthusiasm displayed by the students proves that blended learning has provided the students with the necessary instruments, material, and support to enable them complete scholarly writings' projects. Professors can help students achieve in their course work by affording opportunities for improving skills, using feedback, and providing assistance in preparing for written work.

The litmus test question has checked the student's intention, focus and reliability about the awareness of test is shown in figure 16 as:

Question 15: Litmus Test Question

The litmus test question posed to the pupils, the objective was to see and assess how much attention they paid. This question concerned the students into choosing the colour of the sky from among choices that were presented to him/her. All the students answered the question correctly, as anticipated, which indicates that all of them participated in the activity and comprehended the objective of the questionnaire. This evades that students' eyes were open and alert during the feedback session which as a way of demonstrating cognitive presence.

The recommendation rating for blended learning as improved version scale is shown as:

Question 16: Recommendation Rating for Blended Learning as Improved Version Scale

The rationale for the inquiry was to discern from the students their sentiments on other students employing the blended learning for English language writing courses. 54. Among the replies, 5% of people indicated they supported it; a smaller number firmly supported it. This implies that majority of the students had a good impression of blended learning and would recommend others to use this mode of learning. Regarding the recommendation, the students were of the opinion that other people may also find the blended learning method beneficial and as for themselves they stated it assisted them in enhancing their writing skills. Despite this, and even though many students mentioned the positive aspects of the blended learning model, the percentage of those who strongly supported it was quite low; thus, there could be some opportunities for further growth or areas that students think the model can be reinforced even more.

However, the answers provide educators and institutional that are considering implementing blended learning for English language writing courses timely information from the perspective of the student.

Results and Discussion

This study revealed that experimental group, who was trained in blended learning, performed statistically significantly better than the control group, those who were taught in the traditional face to face method based on the independent sample t-test. In particular, a significant difference in the parameter of mean scores was identified in favor of the experimental group. This result can be explained that the blended learning strategy improved the students' writing skills in the experimental group. The analysis of t-test results indicated the fact that the instructional strategy was the cause for the Groups' difference in writing performance instead of chance. These differences can also be observed through the mean scores where the t-test's p-Value is less than the significant level alpha. From the above analysis it can be concluded that compared to the conventional method, the blended learning method was more effective in enhancing the student's writing skills. This proves how effective blended learning method is in enhancing student's writing skills and it also explain how effective the blended learning approach can be in the teaching and learning of languages.

In the feedback questionnaire, a number of participants admitted awareness of the benefits of the identified blended learning strategy and recommended it for local use with a view

to promoting the participants' career progression in academic institutions. This acknowledgement also insistent on the necessity of integrating the writing materials and online courses into the blended learning model in able to meet the various needs of the learners and equip them with the confidence that can take charge of learning process they are undergoing.

1. **What is the Impact of Blended Learning on Teaching English Language Academic writing skills at Undergraduate Level in Pakistan?**

In the last few decades literature, and interest has been increasing regarding the blended learning approach with the teaching learning outcome of academic writing of the English language in under graduate students in Pakistan. Teaching languages through blended learning is an inspiring and effective form of approach. Education can be defined as a combination of face-to-face lessons and lectures with information found on the World Wide Web. This approach takes the best of both virtual and face to face learning environment to give the students an interesting learning atmosphere. Portable writings, notebooks, and lectures are traditional college English writing education methods regarded as core elements of the teacher's toolkit. While these approaches can be possible to be effective, they could not optimally use the technological advancement that could increase learning impact or meet the needs of the learners as far as their learning types are concerned.

On the other hand, blended learning integrates use of various technologies in learning hence avails several opportunities where students can practice on their writing skills other than the class time. In relation to the research questions, the findings of the study revealed that the students in experimental group had significantly the optimal improvements in their writing performance compared to those in the control group. Since the p-value of the experimental group was below the significance level, this indicated that the differences in performance were not likely due to chance. Thus, it can be ascertained that the strategy of blending the conventional student writing skills with the online writing environment enhanced the academic writing skills of students.

AlMueezar (2020) also aimed to establish the level of satisfaction towards blended learning alongside the effectiveness of the approach in improving research writing skills of the learners. The conclusions were partly favorable and mostly expressing agreement with the fact that the mentioned strategy can be effective for students to improve their research writing skills; organization of the experiment IT blended learning helped for students to enhance the communication and interaction as well as reduce the stress in the class. Kartawijaya (2018) research examined how they assist their students in composing better paragraphs through an online media and based on some aspects that have an impact on the students' performance in writing descriptive paragraphs. The outcome revealed that on-line writing instruction fostered improvement of students' writing skills especially in the area of descriptive paragraph writing and that, a number of facets such as curriculum media teaching approach and classroom management were elements that made a difference. The outcome of this study point to a number of important advantages of blended learning for undergraduate English writing instruction, including:

1.1 Enhanced Learning Outcomes

The analysis of the outcome of the experimental group shows the effectiveness of blended learning approach in developing the academic writing proficiency. When a web type of learning procedure is added to the traditional approach to education, a comprehensive process of learning numerous aspects of language is achieved.

1.2 Enhanced Motivation and Engagement

Students' learning is more enhanced and productive when multimedia or any interrelated web items are involved. Therefore, this enhanced engagement helps in the sustainment of student's attention and their participation in the learning process.

1.3 Enhanced Learning Outcomes

By the end of the experiment, the writing abilities of the experimental group were significantly enhanced, hence real-world blended learning may enhance pupils' academic writing skills. While traditional schooling can be identified as encompassing certain aspects in learning language, use of internet by teachers provides additional process, which might be considered as many sided when combined.

1.4 Enhanced Motivation and Engagement

The use of Web-Quests, games and other forms of multimedia presentations may help students make their studying more interesting. This increased engagement is important in keeping the students and their attention focused on the learning process.

1.5 Enhanced Opportunities for Collaborative Learning

Collaborative Group and interpersonal interaction employing collaborative tools are often a part of a BL model to enhance the group projects' execution. The tools which enable students to complete tasks, share comments, and even have valuable discussions include wikis, discussion boards, and collaborative documents. This cooperative method not only refines one's dispute solving and writing skills but also shapes the communication abilities. Students find themselves learning that writing can be a social process where other peers' feedback can help enhance their writing significantly.

1.6 Development of Digital Knowledge and Skills

As technical literacy is imperative and compulsory in the contemporary society. Given that blended learning involves the student's usage of digital technologies, navigation between learning environments, and web resource utilization, it is possible to conclude that it is greatly integrated with digital literacy. They stand to have improved writing skills from this exposure and also prepare them for the future learning environments and workplace that demands the use of technology. Accepting information technology instills a number of skills in learners, for instance, searching information, evaluating information and communication using technology among them.

1.7 Support for Various Learning Styles

Features such as group work, self-paced learning, collaborative learning, and project-based learning are made possible through blended learning hence benefiting students with different learning styles. For instance, the students learnt through aural means, through the podcasts and recorded lectures for the audio logical learners; kinesthetic learning via the practical assignments, simulations and the online proctored practical lessons for the kinesthetic learners; graphic learning through the art work and Graphic demonstrative and illustrative work for graphic learners; video learning aids for video logical learners. This multifaceted approach means that, no matter the approach taken to their own learning, all students will be able to understand the concepts behind said complex writing topics and approaches.

1.8 Continuous and Diverse Assessment Methods

Self and peer assessment can be more frequency and varied with blended learning. Besides the ordinary tests and assignments, students can also be assessment through internet tests the participation in newsgroups and the presentation of digital portfolios. Many of these approaches make it possible to carry out timely interventions pointing to specific areas of need

and provide a broader view of students' development. Constant feedback from constant assessment therefore retains the students' attention and is more indicative of progress.

1.9 Increased Access to Resources

In a blended learning environment students can easily reach through a plethora of materials they would normally not get in a traditional classroom. Advancement in technology especially the internet means that there is increase in the number of resources that students can use to enhance their learning.

1.10 Flexibility in Learning Pace

Blended learning also has it that learners do move at their own pace. This scenario saves the quick learners the trouble of having to wait for the other batch to progress; the slow learners, on the other hand, can learn at their own pace and practice whenever they are ready to do so. Due to the free style approach of students' writing, they are not under pressure of maintaining the speed set by the teacher, this is good for kids in terms of their confidence and level of anxiety. It may provide a more personal approach to learning which may enhance the student's skill in writing as well as retention of the skill.

In the context of Pakistan, blended learning has several positive impacts. On the use of blended learning in teaching academic writing in the English language for undergraduate students. Thus, an extensive, adaptable, and fascinating educational context is generated when traditional learning environments and context are supplemented by virtual ones. The results of the study revealed that there is a significant enhancement of students' writing skills when implementing blended learning approach. The presented concept of the mixed learning, which is proved for the multi-style approach, increases digital competencies, provides constant assessment, and promotes students' independence, is an innovative and effective approach to language teaching. The expansion and more detailed research of the blending learning model by educational organizations requires a focus on the professional development of teachers, equal distribution of resources, and ongoing organizational changes to meet students' needs. With the help of this comprehensive strategy, students will improve the essential writing skills relevant to both academic success and lifelong learning.

Thus, blended learning has a tremendously positive influence in teaching academic writing in English in the undergraduate level of studies in Pakistan. This strategy proves to be effective as shown by improvement in writing skills among the students in the experimental classes besides the remarks from the students. In addition, results of a prior experimental and survey study revealed that by employing blended learning, it is possible to increase learners' autonomy, motivation, and engagement while enhancing their academic outcomes. Information technology when employed along with other traditional methods of teaching provides a more flexible and interactive teaching-learning environment that is beneficial to all one type of students. Teachers should be offered support and development ongoing in an effort to ensure effective implementation of the strategies; This is more so as educational institutions enhance their blended learning strategies.

2. How does the traditional teaching method and blended learning method cause variations in learning of students at undergraduate level in Pakistan?

Education in the current world is constantly changing, including the methods used to educate our students, where the effectiveness of such approaches is constantly evaluated and adjusted. Two important modalities are the blended learning and the traditional mode of teaching and learning. The traditional form of education for ages has been face-to-face teaching and learning that takes place in a classroom. On the other hand, blended learning is a modern

approach to learning that will incorporate the use of technology for enhancing the quality of learning. It combines face-to-face learning with part or full online learning. The present work complies a comparative analysis of these two approaches in relation to their impact on undergraduate student-learning in context of Pakistan with reference to result, access, engagement and flexibility.

2.1 Traditional Teaching Method

2.1.1 Structure and Environment

With regards to classroom setting, the teachers are assumed to provide instruction to pupils through formal education methods. This approach highlights face-to-face communication between student and teachers, taking notes, reading books and lecture. The class is structured, and the students are assigned certain positions in the class along with specific times to do certain tasks.

2.1.2 Advantages of Traditional Teaching

1. Direct/in-person communication: Its instruction, and students this is one of the key benefits of traditional instruction, we might add. This makes it possible to give feedback, questions that pupils may have together with creating intimacy that may lead to inspiring of pupils.
2. Discipline and Routine: Students who have some learning from the provision of close supervision and regularity can be able to discover that the mechanical approaches to learning in the normal classroom lead to orderliness and integrity.
3. Hands-on Learning: The establishment of the physical presence and close supervision that conventional education provides is helpful for some disciplines, primarily the ones which require several hands-on experiences (such as laboratory sciences or engineering).
4. Cultural Fit: Conventional instructional approaches are well-integrated in the educational system in many countries among them being Pakistan and are usually more popular among parents and students.
5. pupils.

2.1.3 Challenges of Traditional Teaching

1. Limited Accessibility: Those in rural areas, those who have issues with transits or any other factors that would make it difficult for them to attend the in-person classes may find traditional teaching to be a lesser form of learning.
2. Passive Learning: This approach often leads to teaching through telling whereby students passively receive information with little or no interaction. Effectively, retention rates will be affected negatively while there are possibilities that the critical thinking aspect will also receive a blow.
3. Universal Size: It is also important to note that the traditional approach may not allow for enrollment for any student, based on his/her learning style and pace. The multiples of the skills and attitudes of the differently minded people could be at a disadvantage.

2.2 Blended Learning Method

2.2.1. Structure and Environment

Blended learning refers to the hybrid used of technology both inside as well as outside the class to support education lesson delivery. This way learning can happen in a more open environment where students can get the material and can participate in face-to-face and online activities.

2.2.2 Advantages of Blended Learning

Flexibility and accessibility:

One of the advantages obtained by learners who are involved in blended learning is the fact that they are allowed to study at their own preferred time and in their preferred method. This will prove especially beneficial for those who might have other commitments, or who live far away from schools and other establishments.

1. Engagement & Interactivity: Discussion boards, finals quizzes, and other media embedded in the basic components of a blend can enhance the learners' involvement by using various active educating approaches.
2. Availability of Resources: Apart from the conventional text book, learners may also further their learning by gaining access to various internet facilities such as databases, videos as well as articles.
3. Development of Skills: Learning with the use of technology helps student develop the significant digital literacy skills, which are so essential in the modern workplace.

2.2.3 Blended Learning's Challenges

1. Technological Barriers: This means that underlying elements of different pupils' proximity to the internet or to technology may mean difference in the probabilities that exist for the learning process.
2. Self-Discipline Required: Those students who have been in classrooms with a lot of organization may feel that blended learning requires even more personal accountability as well as timeliness.
3. Quality of Online Content: The success of the blended learning is thus greatly determined by use of quality online options and combining online with face- to-face options.

2.3 Comparative Analysis

2.3.1. Motivation and Involvement

Conventional Method/ Traditional Method: Teacher's ability to capture the class means a lot in terms of the characteristics of classroom especially as far as students' participation is concerned. While using direct communication and getting the quick feedback, there is a proven option of motivating people. However, it may from time- to-time result in passive acquisition of knowledge where the pupils are only receivers of knowledge in the class.

Blended Learning: Most of the time the use of the interactive and multimedia material has been found to increase students' interest in blended learning. Learners could be more encouraged by having many resources at their disposal and/or they set their own learning schedule. This learning experience is considered to be progressive because of the variation of the activities and learning resources used.

2.3.2. Inclusivity and Accessibility

Conventional Method/ Traditional Method: It is only accessible to such a user that can physically attend the classes as arranged by the respective institutions. Students from the remote

areas will possibly have challenges in participating in the learning process or those with physical disabilities.

Blended Learning: Thanks to the increased availability given by blended learning students can access resources from any Internet connected place. This is especially so given that it is relatively more flexible for part-time employees, workers with disabilities suggesting that they should go to school, married people among others.

2.3.3. Flexibility and Adaptability

Conventional Method/ Traditional Method: With its defined course of study and time tables the traditional form of learning is less flexible. Here it must be noted that flexibility is frequently limited to the teacher's ability to make changes in the classes right away.

Blended Learning: This approach is very flexible because it allows the students to study at their own pace and revisits certain lessons as they deem fit. Due to the flexibility of the materials, education becomes more personal and adaptive at the same time.

2.3.4 Learning Outcomes

Conventional Method/ Traditional Method: Moreover, there is evidence that proves the effectiveness of traditional teaching approaches for students, particularly for those who require direct guidance and quick feedback for their learning. It might not, however, be able to fully satisfy every student and especially the one who learn best in classes that are more adventurous and exciting.

Blended Learning: The studies showed that using the advantages of online materials combined with the positive aspects of traditional teaching leads to improved learning outcomes. Due to the blended learning's ability to be interactive coupled with the fact that it is relatively flexible it enhances the learning process and retention of the knowledge.

2.3.4 Findings

The results of the experimental group have revealed significant enhancements compared to the participants in the control group. Preparing to write or when writing the experimental group attained a higher p-value hence making it work better in integrated learning.

Engagement: The students that were in the blended learning group said that they were more engaged than their counterparts in other categories because of the interactive feature of the online part.

Flexibility: There is increased understanding and memory due to ease afforded by BL to students whereby the students were able to study at their own pace and hence there was better understanding of the course content.

Utilisation of Resources: The excess of the different internet resources enriched the educational process, as students gained the access to the various patterns of view. Skills Development: Self-organisation and use of technologies for communication and learning: the students in the blended learning group were also able to enhance separately the skills of time management and use of technologies for learning in addition to their general writing skills. Concerning the teaching of English writing skills the following conclusions can be made:

2.4 Implications for Teaching English Writing Skills
2.4.1 Traditional Method

Strengths: Effective at helping the learners gain discipline, providing quick feedback and assists in the teaching of basic concepts.

Limitations: Less flexible, is not as interesting to each and every student, and could possibly be inaccessible to student.

2.4.2 Blended Learning

Strengths: Strengths: Beneficial for general improvement of engagement, increases flexibility, helps to implement personalized approach to learning, and raises digital competencies.

Limitations: Differ to some extent in terms of the quality of Internet sources; based on the individuals' self-discipline and technological opportunities.

With the help of the records of the student learning results between blended learning and respective conventional teaching methodologies, this paper showed how learning is evolving. Blended learning is a combination of the formal design paired with face-to-face interactions of traditional methods and the freedom, increased interest, and availability of additional information. The research done at the Government College Faisalabad exemplifies how the approach may improve the students' English writing skills in the context of the Pakistani undergraduate learners. To some extent, the teachers may succeed with the best of both worlds by constructing the method that encompasses all the qualities of both the traditional and constructivist approaches to teaching thereby constructing the kind and embracing learning environment which responds to the diverse requirements of the students. It is believed that in the future of deep technological advancement, the aspect of blended learning is likely to play a significant role in the delivery of educational systems.

3.What is students' perspective regarding learning English through blended learning approach?

The feedback questionnaire indicated that 48.5% of respondents claim that they take their pet with them when they travel on vacation. From the results obtained, designed with reference to figure 2 above, it was observed that students observed an enhancement in their writing skills. Furthermore, 42.4% of the students agreed with the idea that the blended learning experience highlighted in the research comprises online writing materials and tutorials as the most beneficial components. From this it could be deduced that the amalgamation of, and the integration of information and technology with the conventional approaches to education could positively enhance learning results. Pupils involved in the blended learning technique were administration a feedback form to of see their views about learning English. The richness and appeal of their points of view acquiring a range of input on blended learning related issues were depicted by their comments. An in-depth examination of the students' comments is provided below: An in-depth examination of the students' comments is provided below:

3.1 Feedback Question 1: Improvement in Writing Skills

Considerable Improvement: 48.5% of students using the content involving response to the first questionnaire item said that they experienced a tremendous enhancement in writing skills. This means that more than half of the participants perceived blended learning as a very effective means to enhance their write upon skills.

3.2 Feedback Question 2: Effectiveness of Online Writing Tutorials and Resources

Positive Effect: As for the second question, the given percentage is 42. 4% of the learners believed that the online writing materials and lessons which form part of the blended learning

integration were of great benefit. This underlines the significance of high quality of information found and accessed on the web for supporting students' study.

3.3 Feedback Question 3: Frequency of Using Online Resources

Usage Patterns: The third question further pointed to the fact that 36.4% students stated that they did not use internet resources on a day-to-day basis but relieved it sometimes in a day out of the classroom. From this, it can be stated that while students found the tools useful, the former did not fully rely on them, which suggests the successful combination of online and offline studying.

3.4. Feedback Question 4: Accessibility and Ease of Navigation

User-Friendly Materials: Concerning the fourth question, 60.4% of students thus agreed to the usability and openness of the given online writing resources. On this front it has a positive bearing on how easy it is to negotiate and how effective the design of the digital resources is within the context of the identified blended learning framework.

3.5 Feedback Question 5: Understanding Grammar Rules and Writing Techniques

69.7% of students said that the writing activities in the online part of the course and the quizzes that were carried out were very effective in helping comprehend the rules of grammar and strategies of writing. This was shown in the fifth question which asked the respondents to indicate their expectation of how much their organization's information security would be improved by using the cloud platforms. This indicates that perhaps the most important aspect of the associated online component was interaction.

3.6 Feedback Question 6: Improvement in Grammar Skills

Notable increase: Regarding the sixth question, 57.6% when observing the students' perception of the level of their achievements as a result of the blended learning process, mentioned that they are quite certain they got an increase of their grammatical knowledge. This proves that the method effectively solves the problems of the identified initial linguistic skills.

3.7 Feedback Question 7: Preferred Mode of Feedback

Instructor's Written Comments: As to the seventh question, 36.4% of the total respondents expressed their preference for written commendation from the instructor for the assignments done in the course. This suggests that the trainers' input in many ways, is still personable.

3.8 Feedback Question 8: Helpfulness of Virtual Writing Workshops and Discussions

Highly Beneficial: Regarding the eighth question, 57.6% Survey results revealed that students claimed that their writing got better by attending Virtual Writing Workshops/Conversations. This shows how well the shared, collaborative elements of the blended learning environment are integrating.

3.9 Feedback Question 9: Technology Integration

Enhanced Learning Experience: 75.8% of the students provided the answer to the ninth question affirming that they benefited from the use of technology in their education. A clear and unmistakable signal found in the supermajority points to the fact that technology tools are embraced in schooling.

3.10 Feedback Question 10: Participation in Collaborative Tasks

Participation Frequency: As indicated by the tenth question, 39.4% of students provided the answer to the ninth question affirming that they benefited from the use of technology in their education. A clear and unmistakable signal found in the supermajority points to the fact that technology tools are embraced in schooling.

3.11 Feedback Question 11: Confidence in Writing Abilities

Enhanced Confidence: With reference to the self-identified level of learning by the learners before blended learning was adopted, 60.6 per cent of the students said they had gained increased confidence on their written skills in regard to the eleventh question. This emphasizes how the method assists students to build their confidence.

3.12 Feedback Question 12: Self-assurance in Writing Proficiency

Increased Confidence: Regarding the twelfth question, the results obtained were 54.4% of the students' response indicated that they sometimes required and used writing-related materials and tools other than those in the course. This means that while the lectures note that were supplied in the course acted as the main information source, the students also sought for other information sources.

3.13 Feedback Question 13: Use of Additional Resources

Occasional Use: In response to the thirteen question 54.4% of student's overall effectiveness perspective on blended learning revealed that only 4% of students considered the general connotations of the blended learning to be moderately effective but not highly effective. This proves that although students' blended learning is favorable, there is still room for growth.

3.14 Feedback Question 14: Overall Efficiency

Moderately Effective: The option chosen in the fourteen-question told that there were 42.4% Students' overall effectiveness perspective on blended learning revealed that students considered the general connotations of the blended learning to be moderately effective but not highly effective. This proves that although students' blended learning is favorable, there is still room for growth.

3.15 Feedback Question 15: Litmus Test Question

Active Minds: All the students got the sky's colour asked in the litmus test question right, this showing that they were fully engaged and paying attention during the taking in of the questionnaire.

3.16 Feedback Question 16: Recommendation for Blended Learning

Positive Recommendation: Based on the last question, 54.5% the blended learning mode would attract the students who said they would advise other students to take English language writing courses through this mode. This shows a high amount of satisfaction with the strategy and its likely benefits which are rather general.

Students were provided with feedback form that provides analysis of their perception on learning English in blended learning classroom. The results show that respondents possess a more or less positive view of this teaching approach as a learning method, point out several significant benefits and possible improvement suggestions. A total of 48% of the students conducted more writing showed first improvement, which indicates that the proposed blended learning strategy is helpful to facilitate students' writing abilities. Hence this demonstrates that there is a possibility of improving the writing skill through the fusion of conventional classroom learning with the Internet.

Furthermore, 42.4% when asked how helpful was using the online writing materials or tutorials, the students replied very helpful. This underlines the necessity of qualitative and easily accessible Internet sources as important tools for student's learning. The frequency of using online resources was also investigated, and the pattern indicated that 36.4% met this usage level. Rather than reporting that they used these resources several of students stated that they used these resources outside the classroom. This mean that while students appreciate the use of internet resources, the extent to which they applied it was moderate and only used as an adjunct

to other teachings. Additionally, 60.4% of students stated that getting and using online writing resources was easy; this is relevant to learning effectively. It is likely that the very nature of these materials to be easy to use played a role in the positive effects that were observed concerning students' learning.

69.7% of the respondents claimed that online activities and quizzes were very useful in ensuring that those acquired grammatical rules and writing skills. This high proportion shows that for pupils there are many benefits concerning the comprehending of complicated subjects in language usage, specifically when they interact with the online elements. Correspondingly, 57.6% when it comes to the implementation of the blended learning approach in teaching the foundational language skills, the students observed the enhanced improvement in the mastery of grammar.

36.4% Specifically, the survey suggested that students among the respondents decreased the proportion of feedback preference and mentioned that they would like to receive handwritten remarks from professors, which once again proved that the modification idea is valuable in the context of a blended learning environment. In addition, the organisation of virtual writing workshops and debates was considered extremely useful by 57.6% female students in their regular classes set up for group work were selected and the results indicated that students found these collaborative components helpful in enhancing their writing skills. Notably, 75.6% this table depicts those students stated that technology incorporation enhanced their education in general. Thus, this massive majority proves that it is effective to use technologies in learning aids. However, just 39.4% this rather low figure was confirmed by students' own reports: students said they participated in group projects or collaborative writing every week, which could be an area to potentially increase students' participation. Thus, responding to the basic research question, compared to when blended learning was not used, 60.6% of the students claimed to have achieved heightened levels of self-confidence in writing.

The increase in the level of self-confidence proves that with the help of blended learning, the level of self-confidence of students, which is critical for learning outcomes, can be effectively increased. Thus, even though 54.4% of students sometimes used additional sources, this means that the primary sources met the needs of most of the students, while some of them searched for additional materials. Thus, the evaluation of the blended learning concept is considered quite effective by 42.4% of students, which states that despite the benefits of the strategy, it is still possible to observe certain imperfections. 42.4% Very few students responded that they were well prepared for academic writing; which is a sign that their preparedness of writing at a higher level has enhanced. When it comes to the final quiz/ questionnaire, every student was active in answering all the questions; a sort of litmus test question was asked, and was answered by every student. Finally, the preference for the application of the blended learning methodology for English language writing courses was confirmed by the views of a total of 54.5 percent of students, thereby pointing to a generally satisfying learning experience that is associated with the above-listed advantages of the approach.

At last, the feedback questionnaire reveals the fact that the majority of students still consider blended learning as a good method to learn to write in English. Testimonies indicating that with this method, the general confidence level rises, alongside the understanding of grammar and writing capability. The effectiveness rating and extra resources have been sighted as a rather high while the usage has been evident as being very low hence there is room for improvement activities. Taking all these factors into consideration, one is in a position to conclude that the

blended learning strategy enjoys a high acceptance level, especially with the fused instructional format.

Limitations of the Study

There are following limitations of this study as:

First, only one university was selected for the purpose of the research, which also involved a relatively small number of cases.

Secondly, the study was confined to participants' English writing skills.

Thirdly, the research was done for only two months, which limited the time scope of the analysis.

Last, the study failed to address such issues as the possibility of the challenges that might beset the innovation of blended learning.

Conclusion

The research investigated and determined the effects, and differences between blended learning and face-to-face instruction on the written English proficiency of undergraduate students. The sample of the study comprised an experimental group of thirty students and control group of thirty students; collectively forming a total sample of sixty students, conducted at Government College Faisalabad. While the control group was provided with instructions in the traditional style using conventional approaches and paper-based handouts, the experimental group was given blended instructions which comprise of the internet resources and technological learning aids. Pre- and post-tests were conducted according to IELTS sample tests and feedback questionnaires were collected to obtain qualitative data about the students' experiences. As the research outcomes revealed, the experimental group of students showed the enhanced level of achievement in the improvement of their writing skills as compared to the students with the controlled group. The independent samples t-test revealed that the obtained p value in the experimental group is much lower compared with that of the control group, this means that blended learning is an effective approach to enhancing the students' writing skills. Additional data was collected through feedback questionnaire that was issued to students, which indicated that they appreciated efforts that had been made towards integration of technology in teaching and learning process, and believed that online materials were handy and easily accessible. Altogether, the findings demonstrated that the experimental group's writing effectiveness increased and therefore supported apprehensive that the blended learning is a superior method of teaching English writing than the conventional ways.

Recommendations

Future studies should employ larger and diverse samples to increase the external validity of the findings. Future research should investigate the extent to which the model influences the speaking, listening, reading, and other components of the language skills. For the research on the effects of the incorporation of blended learning on the students' writing skills, longitudinal research studies must be conducted. Subsequent research should examine circumstances that teachers and pupils may face, including technical difficulties; teachers' and pupils' unfamiliarity with the system; and resistance to change. An understanding of these barriers can help educators develop strategies to counter the forces and improve the delivery of blended learning.

REFERENCES

Akhtar, R., Hassan, H., Saidalvi, A., & Hussain, S. (2019). A systematic review of the challenges and solutions of ESL students' academic writing. *International Journal of Engineering and Advanced Technology*, 8(5), 1169-1171.

Alsowat, H. H. (2022). Hybrid learning or virtual learning? Effects on students' essay writing and digital literacy. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 13(4), 872-883.

Alrouji, O. O. (2020). The Effectiveness of Blended Learning in Enhancing Saudi Students' Competence in Paragraph Writing. *English Language Teaching*, 13(9), 72-82.

Anthony Jnr, B. (2022). An exploratory study on academic staff perception towards blended learning in higher education. *Education and Information Technologies*, 27(3), 3107-3133.

Arani, J. A. (2018). Advancing Academic Writing in a Mobile Skype-Based Blended Model. *International Journal of Interactive Mobile Technologies*, 12(3).

El-Maghraby, A. L. (2021). Investigating the effectiveness of moodle based blended learning in developing writing skills for university students. *Journal of Research in Curriculum Instruction and Educational Technology*, 7(1), 115-140.

Guo, Y., Wang, Y., & Ortega-Martín, J. L. (2023). The impact of blended learning-based scaffolding techniques on learners' self-efficacy and willingness to communicate. *Porta Linguarum Revista Interuniversitaria de Didáctica de las Lenguas Extranjeras*, (40), 253-273.

Hadiyanto, H., Sulistiyo, U., Mukminin, A., Haryanto, E., & Syaiful, S. (2022). The Effect of Blended Learning on EFL Students' Performance in Research Methodology and Practice of 21st Century Skills. *Journal of Educators Online*, 19(3), n3.

Müller, C., & Mildenberger, T. (2021). Facilitating flexible learning by replacing classroom time with an online learning environment: A systematic review of blended learning in higher education. *Educational Research Review*, 34, 100394.

Rahman, A. M. A., Azmi, M. N. L., & Hassan, I. (2020). Improvement of English writing skills through blended learning among university students in Malaysia. *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 8(12A), 7694-7701.

Saeed Abd El-hameed, R., Farouk Mohammed, M., & Kamel Mohammed, L. (2023). Blended learning for developing writing skills to primary. pupils. مجلة دراسات تربوية واجتماعية, 29(10.1), 1-22.

Zahro, S. K. (2023). An Alternative Digital Feedback through Screencast: Blended Learning Practices on Academic Writing. *English Review: Journal of English Education*, 11(1), 37-46.